

AMERICAN ANTIQUITY

VOLUME 84 NUMBER 3 JULY 2019



SAA
SOCIETY FOR AMERICAN ARCHAEOLOGY

SOCIETY FOR AMERICAN ARCHAEOLOGY

REVIEWS

American Antiquities: Revisiting the Origins of American Archaeology. TERRY A. BARNHART, 2015. University of Nebraska Press, Lincoln. xviv + 572 pp. \$75.00 (hardcover), ISBN 978-0-8032-6842-5.

Reviewed by Ian W. Brown, University of Alabama

In my senior year of college in 1973, I audited a lecture course taught by Gordon R. Willey and Jeremy A. Sabloff. It was a terrific course, and I thought at the time what a wonderful book it would make. Not long after, when I was a first-year graduate student, I discovered that these scholars had indeed put their words into print (Willey and Sabloff, *A History of American Archaeology*, 1974). I remember my excitement in showing the book to an older and wiser graduate student. His response was somewhat deflating, "Yes, it's great, but it kind of takes the fun out of discovery." I knew exactly what he meant, because from then on the "Speculative Period," the "Classificatory-Historical Period" (and its three subperiods), and the "Explanatory Period" framed my thoughts as to the structure of American archaeology. It all seemed so simple once the Willey-Sabloff structure existed. There were antiquaries, there were archaeologists, and the various practitioners were easily pigeonholed into categories. The basic theme, as it applied to eastern North America, was initially that there were those who believed in the presumptive lost race of Mound Builders, and then the dynamic switched with the weight of evidence favoring Indians. The Smithsonian Mound Survey tome (Cyrus Thomas, *Report on the Mound Explorations of the Bureau of Ethnology*, 1894) was the coup de grâce to the myth of the ancient Mound Builder race. Numerous scholars in the last four decades have revealed that the story is far more convoluted, however, and that is because the characters themselves were so complex. Stephen Williams's *Fantastic Archaeology: The Wild Side of North American Prehistory* (1991) did much to put the fun of discovery back into the equation, but as its focus was largely on hoaxes, a more detailed study of the history of American archaeology was needed.

American Antiquities fits that need. Barnhart is a historian who knows his craft well. He has devoted more than three decades to studying and writing about early archaeologists, especially those of the Ohio and Upper Mississippi valleys, which is the primary arena of this book. Barnhart reminds us that people who wrote about the past in the 1700s and early 1800s, whether they were in armchair or field, were doing archaeology. We may now brand them as antiquaries, religious zealots, or the like, but we must be careful not to judge those writers by present attitudes. Any one time has to be considered on its own terms. A topic that comes up repeatedly is the misunderstanding of the terms or concepts that were used in the past, because what they mean now may be very different. As an example, it is confusion over what the term *race* meant to Squier and Davis in *Ancient Monuments of the Mississippi Valley* (1848) that has tainted their monumental work.

What is wonderful about Barnhart's study is that he writes with the fluidity of the best historians. As a historiographer, he has dug deeply into archives to compare, contrast, and understand voluminous sources (letters, unpublished manuscripts, diaries, etc.) and how they project on their times. The story that he tells stretches from the single burial mound excavation of Thomas Jefferson in the Commonwealth of Virginia to the Mound Survey of Cyrus Thomas, which involved hundreds of mound excavations across dozens of states. The usual characters are put forth, such as Caleb Atwater, Ephraim G. Squier, Edwin H. Davis, Henry R. Schoolcraft, Increase A. Lapham, Daniel G. Brinton, Frederic Ward Putnam, Cyrus Thomas, and the like, but new and interesting perspectives are offered on each of these scholars. Moreover, there is a considerable amount of fascinating information offered on lesser-known scholars such as Constantine S. Rafinesque, Montroville W. Dickeson, Stephen D. Peet, Wills De Hass, and many others.

A great value of this book is the endnotes (52 pages). I found myself continually flipping back and forth between text, endnotes, and bibliography (93 pages). The latter, which is divided according to

unpublished archival sources, primary sources, and secondary sources, is an incredible tool for anyone interested in the history of U.S. archaeology up to about 1900. It should be noted that the first time *American Antiquities* was used in a book title (Josiah Priest, *American Antiquities and Discoveries in the West*, 1833), the book itself was enormously popular. Priest's volume went through three revised editions, with 22,000 copies made within 30 months, and all sold to subscribers! I'm not sure that Barnhart's volume will have as great a success in sales, but to my way of thinking it should. I highly recommend it to scholars of American archaeology and to the public at large. It is a marvelous work.

Archaeology and Ancient Religion in the American Midcontinent. BRAD H. KOLDEHOFF and TIMOTHY R. PAUKETAT. 2018. University of Alabama Press, Tuscaloosa. xiv + 350 pp. \$64.95 (hardcover), ISBN 978-0-8137-1996-0.

Reviewed by David H. Dye, University of Memphis

Heritage collections, large datasets, and new analytical techniques frame the arguments and discussions in *Archaeology and Ancient Religion in the American Midcontinent*. This solid, timely, and well-researched volume is based on papers from a symposium held in honor of Thomas E. Emerson, retired director of the Illinois State Archaeological Survey, at the annual Midwest Archaeological Conference in 2014. A lynchpin of Emerson's research, and a major focus of the book, centers on the application of advanced analytical techniques to artifacts and assemblages from the Midcontinent. He and his colleagues have conducted groundbreaking research through decades of systematic cultural resource management investigations, coupled with reanalyses of older collections.

In the introduction, Koldehoff and Pauketat frame the volume's underlying assumption: religious practices may be analyzed, detected, and interpreted by investigating the roles played by objects, places, and substances. The overriding conceptual framework is based on the delineation of places and things through an archaeology of depositional context, physical properties, and ritual landscapes.

Taking the perspective that powerful objects shaped human events in the past, Koldehoff and Kenneth Farnsworth employ X-ray diffraction and a field portable spectrometer (PIMA) to analyze stone pipes dating from the Late Archaic through Middle Woodland periods. They document changes in the ritual significance of these earliest smoking pipes and demonstrate the

increased ceremonial importance of stone pipes in the formulation and spread of Hopewell. One of their conclusions, contrary to long-held ideas, is that Middle Woodland platform pipes developed in Illinois and circulated to Ohio.

Based on a large database of tool caches from the American Bottom, Melissa Baltus argues that such deposits are not examples of utilitarian resources but, rather, represent religious offerings and the practice of gathering, which animates objects and spaces. Thus, the use of everyday objects demonstrates their participation in relationships with the animated world as part of private, ritual practices that created and perpetuated relationships with other-than-human beings.

Kathryn Parker and Mary Simon highlight the ancient uses of four "magic plants" found in the American Bottom: datura, morning glory, nightshade, and tobacco. Magic plants were integral to Late Woodland and Mississippian private and public rituals conducted by political and religious leaders who sought portals to the spirit world through drug-induced, altered states of reality.

In their review of Late Woodland and Mississippian mortuary practices, Kristin Hedman and Eve Hargrave summarize transformations in mortuary patterns and population history for the American Bottom. In light of these patterns they present new information and interpretations on Cahokia's Mound 72 interments based on recent bioarchaeological and isotopic analyses of skeletal remains.

Susan Alt summarizes Mississippian ritual architecture at the Emerald Acropolis, a Cahokian shrine center, which provides evidence of the genesis of an ancient religious movement. She argues that Mississippian culture began as a religion that in turn led to similar lifeways; thus building and landscape modifications from the Woodland-to-Mississippian transition resulted primarily from religious rather than political motivations.

Summarizing decades of research, John Richards and Thomas Zych discuss the perception of landscapes and mound construction by Late Woodland and Mississippian groups at Aztalan in southeast Wisconsin as a process of ethnogenesis. Mound building and ritual ceramic placement served as integrating social practices for a mixed population of local residents and immigrant Woodland and Mississippian (or Mississippianized) people.

Presenting evidence of ancient ritual landscapes in southwestern Illinois, Mark Wagner, Jonathan Remo, Kayeleigh Sharp, and Go Matsumoto highlight mound locations and the reuse of rock art sites as shrines founded by Woodland populations. These ritual locales were later enhanced and maintained by